



**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
Patent and Trademark Office**

Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS  
Washington, D.C. 20231

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.
09/177,902	10/23/98	HOLMAN	D E-1658

PAUL W ZIMMERMAN K1 53  
BATTELLE MEMORIAL INSTITUTE  
P O BOX 999  
RICHLAND WA 99352

IM22/1023

EXAMINER
----------

CINTINS, I

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

1724

DATE MAILED: 10/23/00

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

**Commissioner of Patents and Trademarks**

# Office Action Summary

Application No.

09/177,902

Applicant(s)

Holman et al.

Examiner

Ivars C. Cintins

Group Art Unit

1724



☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on Jul 24, 2000

☐ This action is **FINAL**.

☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11; 453 O.G. 213.

A shortened statutory period for response to this action is set to expire 3 month(s), or thirty days, whichever is longer, from the mailing date of this communication. Failure to respond within the period for response will cause the application to become abandoned. (35 U.S.C. § 133). Extensions of time may be obtained under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a).

## Disposition of Claims

☒ Claim(s) 1-20 is/are pending in the application.

Of the above, claim(s) 18-20 is/are withdrawn from consideration.

☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.

☒ Claim(s) 1-17 is/are rejected.

☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.

☐ Claims \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction or election requirement.

## Application Papers

☐ See the attached Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review, PTO-948.

☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to by the Examiner.

☐ The proposed drawing correction, filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is ☐ approved ☐ disapproved.

☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.

☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

## Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

☐ Acknowledgement is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d).

☐ All ☐ Some\* ☐ None of the CERTIFIED copies of the priority documents have been  
☐ received.

☐ received in Application No. (Series Code/Serial Number) \_\_\_\_\_.

☐ received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\*Certified copies not received: \_\_\_\_\_

☐ Acknowledgement is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e).

## Attachment(s)

☒ Notice of References Cited, PTO-892

☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s), PTO-1449, Paper No(s). \_\_\_\_\_

☐ Interview Summary, PTO-413

☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review, PTO-948

☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application, PTO-152

--- SEE OFFICE ACTION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGES ---

Art Unit: 1724

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1-17 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Applicant's admitted prior art in view of Rigby (U.S. Patent No. 2,797,150). As pointed out in the previous Office Action, Applicant has admitted that column based separations employing a valve member comprising an axially moveable solid rod are known in the art (Figs. 4a and 4b). Accordingly, claims 1-17 appear to differ from these admittedly known separation techniques by the use of a valve having a rotatable rod having a "binary" end. Rigby discloses a valve member (i.e. stop cock 14) having an asymmetrical surface (i.e. binary end), which valve member is rotated to control material flow through a column chamber. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to substitute the rotatable valve member of Rigby for axially moveable valve member of the admittedly known system depicted in Figs. 4a and 4b, since this reference valve member is capable of

Serial Number: 09/177,902

Page 3

Art Unit: 1724

controlling material flow through a column chamber in substantially the same manner as the valve member of the admittedly known system, to produce substantially the same results.


Applicant's arguments filed July 24, 2000 have been noted and carefully considered but no longer appear to be relevant in view of the new grounds of rejection.

Applicant is advised that claims 1-17 would be allowed if limited to the embodiment shown in Fig. 5c (i.e. that the matrix material is unpacked by rotating the column chamber with respect to the rod). Also, non-elected claims 18-20 should be canceled.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to I. Cintins whose telephone number is (703) 308-3840. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday through Thursday from 8:30 AM to 7:00 PM.

The fax phone numbers for this art unit are: (703) 305-3599 for "Official" faxes after Final Rejection; (703) 305-7718 for all other "Official" faxes; and (703) 305-3602 for "Draft" and other "Unofficial" faxes.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application should be directed to the Group receptionist whose telephone number is (703) 308-0661.

  
**Ivars C. Cintins**  
**Primary Examiner**  
**Art Unit 1724**

I. Cintins  
October 22, 2000